

#### **Independent Salary Commission**

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE

8:38-

Agendarie 5/12/17 IIME 8:

RECEIVED BY \_

#### **AMENDED AGENDA**

Wednesday, May 17, 2017 6:30 p.m.

Santa Fe Convention Center O'Keefe Room 201 W. Marcy St.

- 1. Call to Order
- 2. Introduction of Committee Members
- 3. Approval of Amended Agenda
- 4. Approval of Minutes: April 25, 2017 meeting
- 5. Presentation by Mr. Hultin and Ms. Boniface for public comment.
  - a. Santa Fe City Charter, City Ordinance 2-1-.2 SFCC 1987; Bill 2016-42 -Duties of ISC and the criteria and data set out in the Ordinance to be used by ISC to set the salary of full time mayor.
  - b. Data gathered and additional Santa Fe and other data including benefits and updating of comparable city data developed since April 25 meeting
  - c. Discussion of data and other relevant information.
- 6. Public Comment (limited to 3 minutes per individual or organization)
- 7. Adjournment

#### PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES IN NEED OF ACCOMODATIONS, CONTACT THE CITY CLERK'S OFFICE AT 505-955-6520, FIVE (5) WORKING DAYS PRIOR TO THE MEETING DATE

#### NOTE: ADDITIONAL DATA WILL BE POSTED ON THE CITY WEB PAGE AS IT BECOMES AVAILABLE AND WILL ALSO BE AVAILABLE AT THE MEETING

City of Santa Fe



Agenda STOVED BY Lynette A. Trujilo ELOEIVED BY Lynette A. Trujilo

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE

#### **Independent Salary Commission**

Wednesday, May 17, 2017 6:30 p.m.

Santa Fe Convention Center O'Keefe Room 201 W. Marcy St.

- 1. Call to Order
- 2. Introduction of Committee Members
- 3. Approval of Agenda
- 4. Approval of Minutes: April 25, 2017 meeting
- 5. New Business:
  - a. Santa Fe City Charter, City Ordinance 2-1-.2 SFCC 1987; Bill 2016-42 review/purpose
  - b. Discussion of data utilized by commission to set salary
  - c. Discussion of proposed range of salary of \$145,000 to \$175,000
- 6. Public Comment (limited to 3 minutes per individual or organization)
- 7. Adjournment

#### PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES IN NEED OF ACCOMODATIONS, CONTACT THE CITY CLERK'S OFFICE AT 505-955-6520, FIVE (5) WORKING DAYS PRIOR TO THE MEETING DATE.

Call to Order / Roll Call       Roll call constitutes a quorum. Meeting was called to order by the Chair at 6:30 pm at the Santa Fe Convention Center, O'Keefe Room, 201 West Marcy Street, Santa Fe, New Mexico. Roll call reflects a quorum.       1         Introduction of Commissioners       The Chair opened meeting; we are here this evening to receive public comment on a preliminary range of salaries discussed at our April 25th, 2017 meeting. The Chair asked each Commissioner to introduce themselves to the audience.       1         Approval of Agenda       Mr. Hochberg moved to approve the amended agenda, second by Ms. Lopez, motion carried by unanimous voice vote.       2         Approval of Minutes, April 25, 2017       Ms. Wilder Flatt moved to approve the minutes as presented, second by Ms. Boniface, motion carried by unanimous voice vote.       2         Presentation by Mr. Hultin on background and responsibilities of the Independent Salary Commission and Ms. Boniface will talk about the data that the Commission and Ms. Boniface will talk about the data that the Commission and salary Commission and salary Commission and the mayor; and establishing an Independent Salary Commission of the Mayor 3 salary effective March 19, 2018.       2 - 4         Public Comments       Each individual is named in the minutes, presentation limited to 3 minutes per person.       4 - 12	Cover Page		0
Commissioners       Information a preliminary range of salaries discussed at our April 25th, 2017 meeting. The Chair asked each Commissioner to introduce themselves to the audience.       2         Approval of Agenda       Mr. Hochberg moved to approve the amended agenda, second by Ms. Lopez, motion carried by unanimous voice vote.       2         Question: Why was the agenda amended?       Response: The agenda was amended only by date; meeting was scheduled for the week prior and the posting was not timely.       2         Approval of Minutes, April 25, 2017       Ms. Wilder Flatt moved to approve the minutes as presented, second by Ms. Boniface, motion carried by unanimous voice vote.       2         Presentation by Mr. Hultin on background and responsibilities of the Independent Salary Commission has been gathering under the Ordinance for the Commission and Ms. Boniface will talk about the data that the Commission and Ms. Boniface is a second by Ms. Boni		Chair at 6:30 pm at the Santa Fe Convention Center, O'Keefe Room, 201 West Marcy Street, Santa Fe, New Mexico. Roll call reflects a	1
by Ms. Lopez, motion carried by unanimous voice voie.         Question: Why was the agenda amended?         Response: The agenda was amended only by date;         meeting was scheduled for the week prior and the         posting was not timely.         Approval of Minutes,         April 25, 2017         Ms. Wilder Flatt moved to approve the minutes as presented,         second by Ms. Boniface, motion carried by unanimous voice         voie.         Presentation by Mr. Hultin         on background and         responsibilities of the         Independent Salary         Commission and Ms.         Boniface will talk about         the data that the         Commission         Commission         and         Santa Fe City Charter, City         Ordinance for the         Commission of the         Mayor; and establishing an         Independent Salary         Commission to set the         Mayor; aslary effective         March 19, 2018.         Public Comments         Each individual is named in the minutes, presentation limited to 3         Ariater bering no further business to come before the Independent         12		public comment on a preliminary range of salaries discussed at our April 25th, 2017 meeting. The Chair asked each	1
April 25, 2017second by Ms. Boniface, motion carried by unanimous voice vote.Presentation by Mr. Hultin on background and responsibilities of the Independent Salary Commission and Ms. Boniface will talk about the data that the Commission has been gathering under the Ordinance for the Commission and Santa Fe City Charter, City Ordinance 2-1.2 SFCC 1987; Bill 2016-42 - Relating to the compensation of the Mayor; and establishing an Independent Salary Commission to set the Mayor's salary effective March 19, 2018.2 - 4Public CommentsEach individual is named in the minutes, presentation limited to 3 minutes per person.4 - 12AdjournmentThere being no further business to come before the Independent12	Approval of Agenda	by Ms. Lopez, motion carried by unanimous voice vote. Question: Why was the agenda amended? Response: The agenda was amended only by date; meeting was scheduled for the week prior and the	2
on background and responsibilities of the Independent Salary Commission and Ms. Boniface will talk about the data that the Commission has been gathering under the Ordinance for the Commission and Santa Fe City Charter, City Ordinance 2-1.2 SFCC 1987; Bill 2016-42 - Relating to the compensation of the Mayor; and establishing an Independent Salary Commission to set the Mayor's salary effective March 19, 2018.Lach individual is named in the minutes, presentation limited to 3 minutes per person.4 - 12AdjournmentThere being no further business to come before the Independent12		second by Ms. Boniface, motion carried by unanimous voice	2
minutes per person.     12       Adjournment     There being no further business to come before the Independent     12	on background and responsibilities of the Independent Salary Commission and Ms. Boniface will talk about the data that the Commission has been gathering under the Ordinance for the Commission and Santa Fe City Charter, City Ordinance 2-1.2 SFCC 1987; Bill 2016-42 – Relating to the compensation of the Mayor; and establishing an Independent Salary Commission to set the Mayor's salary effective	Informational	2-4
Adjournment There being no further business to come before the Independent 12			4 - 12
	Adjournment	There being no further business to come before the Independent	12

#### **Independent Salary Commission**

Wednesday, May 17, 2017 6:30 p.m. – 7:45 p.m. Santa Fe Convention Center – O'Keefe Room Santa Fe, NM

#### 1. Call to Order

Mr. Paul Hultin, Chair for the Independent Salary Commission called the meeting to order at 6:30 pm in the O'Keefe Room, Santa Fe Convention Center, Santa Fe, New Mexico. Quorum is reflected in roll call.

#### **Roll Call:**

Paul F. Hultin, Chairman Linda Wilder Flatt Shannon Moore Boniface Stephen Hochberg Shannon Lopez Andy Wallerstein

#### Not Present:

Bill Smith

#### Others in Attendance:

Lynette Trujillo, HR Director Dan Chacon, Santa Fe New Mexican Interns from UNM: Jenna Davis and Casey Mulligan Audience and Presenters noted in the content of the minutes. (Exhibit A – Sign In Sheet) Fran Lucero, Stenographer

2. Introduction of Commission Members

The Chair opened meeting; we are here this evening to receive public comment on a preliminary range of salaries discussed at our April 25th, 2017 meeting. The Chair asked each Commissioner to introduce themselves.

Paul Hultin, Chair, an attorney who has had a home in Santa Fe since 2001, moved here full time in 2013 and a member of the Colorado Bar and NM Bar. Mr. Hultin was appointed as the Attorney representative under the Ordinance. Mr. Hultin has done Pro Bono work for the City of Santa Fe and has represented them on the Charter Review process. He has had the privilege of representing 37 non-profit organizations in the NM Supreme Court in the New Energy Economy/PNM appeal.

Stephen Hochberg, Retired Law Professor, moved to Santa Fe with his wife 10 years ago and also serves on Planning Commission for the City of Santa Fe and several non-profit groups.

Shannon Lopez, born and raised in Santa Fe and works for the Santa Fe Chamber of Commerce.

Shannon Boniface – She is the HR member and employment consultant. She is the owner of Careers First, an executive recruiting firm and has lived in Santa Fe for 24 years.

Linda Wilder Flatt – Representative for the neighborhoods, she has lived in Santa Fe for 23 years. Moved from east coast. They had a small business in Santa Fe which they sold 2 years ago and is now semi-retired.

Andy Wallerstein, has lived in Santa Fe for 13 years, he is the CEO for Avalon Trust an Investment Firm, Chair of the Board for Site Santa Fe.

3. Approval of Amended Agenda

#### Mr. Hochberg moved to approve the amended agenda, second by Ms. Lopez, motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

Question: Why was the agenda amended? Response: The agenda was amended only by date; meeting was scheduled for the week prior and the posting was not timely.

4. Approval of Minutes: April 25, 2017 meeting

#### Ms. Wilder Flatt moved to approve the minutes as presented, second by Ms. Boniface, motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

5. Presentation by Mr. Hultin on background and responsibilities of the Independent Salary Commission and Ms. Boniface will talk about the data that the Commission has been gathering under the Ordinance for the Commission.

The Chair acknowledged Ms. Lynette Trujillo, Human Resources Director the City and for her professional staff support. Special thank you to the Interns from UNM who have done a lot of the research and produced the data that will be discussed tonight. At April 25<sup>th</sup> meeting we agreed to receive public comments on the preliminary salary of \$145,000 - \$175,000 for the full-time Mayor when a new Mayor is elected in 2018. It was very clear that a decision would not be made at this meeting; the information is for public comment. The Chair said he has received voice mail and e-mail comments and reiterated that no decision has been made at this time. Chair Hultin informed the audience that they would have 3-minutes for presentation and Ms. Trujillo would be the timekeeper. (All documents posted for audience review and paper copies available at sign in desk).

a. Santa Fe City Charter, City Ordinance 2-1.2 SFCC 1987; Bill 2016-42 – Relating to the compensation of the Mayor; and establishing an Independent Salary Commission to set the Mayor's salary effective March 19, 2018.

The process we are in now was created when Charter Amendment 9 was approved in the Municipal 2014 election. Charter Amendment 9 changed the Charter of Santa Fe which in affect is the constitution of the City of Santa Fe to go for the City Manager form of

Government to a full-time Mayor/CEO form of Government. There was a Charter Review Commission that held 26 hearings over a period of 14 months to receive input from the citizens of Santa Fe. The residents throughout the city recommended that Charter Amendment 9 be placed on the ballot. The City Council approved that; it was on the ballot and was approved by 58% of the voters until the Governing Body created a commission, the Independent Salary Commission that would be empowered to set the salary for the full time Mayor. The Charter Amendment 9 provided that the initial salary of the full-time salary of \$74,000 dollars until the City Council passed an Ordinance creating the Independent Salary Commission that would be empowered to set the salary of the full time Mayor. The City Council unanimously adopted the Ordinance that created the Independent Salary Commission; and it provided in Section B. that the Independent Salary Commission was to consider the salaries of other public executives within the County of Santa Fe, including the Santa Fe County Manager, Superintendent of Santa Fe Public Schools, and in addition the Commission is to look at data from cities of comparable size in the region, cost of living, and diversity within the region. The primary criteria are that they have the same form of government.

In the process of this we have looked at the compensation structure of the city generally and particularly in light of the comments about the \$74,000 salary; so we asked Ms. Trujillo was to provide a list of employees that would make more than \$74,000 or more by FY 18 which starts July 1, 2017 and there are approximately over 121 employees who are paid more than \$74,000 plus 40% for fringe benefits up to the highest is the city which is up to \$103,000. Considerations have been discussed to review if the full time Mayor should make less than the 121 city employee salaries.

The Chair expressed his thanks to the New Mexican for the close coverage they have provided to keep our community informed and we have followed up on items that they brought to our attention.

#### Ms. Shannon Boniface

Thank you for being here, as mentioned she is the owner of Careers First. She was approved and appointed as the Charter mandated a member from the human resources industry or employment consultant, which she is. When she is retained to recruit an executive the first thing that she does is ask for a job description. She reviews that and looks for comparable salaries based on that job description. That is exactly what the Commission was asked to do and that is what they did. Since a new job description was approved in the Charter of 2014 the Mayor will become a full-time CEO/Mayor, not a part-time ceremonial Mayor. In looking at the job description and the Charter it states that the Mayor will be the Chief Executive Officer of the city, his position will be full time, he will appoint with the consent of the governing body, the City Manager, the City Clerk, the City Attorney and members of advisory commissions. The Mayor will exercise administrative control and supervision over the City Manager, City Clerk and the City Attorney and have the sole authority to remove them and work with the City Personnel and timely prepare an annual budget, a proposed spending priority and removal by the Finance Committee and the Governing Body. With these new amendments, the CEO/Mayor will be responsible for developing the budget, establishing a legislative agenda, and administrative control over the City Manager, City Clerk and City Attorney.

Ms. Boniface stated that in her 20 years of professional recruitment and experience, it is typical that a CEO is the most highly compensated person in an organization. Common sense would dictate that a CEO with a lot more responsibilities that the employees would not be paid less than the employees he or she is managing. The Charter that was voted on and approved by the citizens of the city of Santa Fe in 2014 election clearly state that they as the Independent Salary Commission are to set the salary for the Mayor by 1) comparing the salaries of other public executives in the county of Santa Fe including the Santa Fe County Manager, Superintendent of Santa Fe Public Schools and the Santa Fe City Manager based on the FY2018. (Exhibit B) The City Manager will make \$145,660.57 with additional benefits at 40%, Santa Fe County Manager salary (FY17) is \$179,707.22 with 35% benefits and the Superintendent of Schools is at \$180,000.00 with added 35% benefits – (FY17).

The second requirement was to review cities of comparable size, form of governments, cost of living and diversity within out region. What did that mean? The Commission looked at comparable cities, we are the city different, it was a little difficult to find to comparable city with all these requirements. Exhibit C shows the cities that the Interns found and the Commission reviewed in comparison to Santa Fe form of government, size and cost of living. On behalf of the Commission, Ms. Boniface stated that they have done what they were asked to do in a very professional way based on the guidelines. Ms. Boniface reiterated that there are no perfect comparable cities.

They based their findings on the following, Chief Executive forms of government, population, salaries and also went further to add benefits which they broke out separate from salaries.

The citizens of Santa Fe did not vote for a salary of \$74,000 a year. That was just a placeholder and the Charter says that it is a placeholder until such time that an Independent Salary Commission is established by city Ordinance and such Commission shall set the salary for Mayor. You will also see that 121 employees in the City make more than \$74,000 a year. It would not be an industry standard in any organization for the CEO/Mayor to be paid less than these 121 employees he or she is managing.

Ms. Boniface said that the Commission is here tonight to make a determination based on the public input and the information that has been compiled and presented to the public tonight.

#### 6. Public Comment (limited to 3 minutes per individual or organization)

It was reiterated that no decision has been made. The Public was asked to sign up, line up to speak, when addressing the commission to give name and address and to limit comments to 3 minutes.

Additional data will be posted to the city website on the salary range and there will be an opportunity for public comment a week from today. Thank you for your attendance.

#### PUBLIC HEARING

<u>Gayle Dawn Price</u> – Santa Fe, NM - 30 year Resident of Santa Fe, stated she has probably lived her longer than anyone on the Commission.

I want to give a different view, different perspective of what you have presented. I don't question the carefully researched statistics and I don't question that your comparisons are factual but as a resident I have a view of how a public servant salary should be determined. I don't want to challenge whether there are already city Executives that are overpaid; that is not the topic tonight. My perspective from having lived here a very long time, my perspective is that this is a city that claims to be a city different. The median income in this city is \$50, 213. In the spirit of being the city different I think we should take a different approach and send a different message to the taxpayers in this town who pay the Mayor's salary. I think the taxpayers deserve to know what they are paying and why they are paying this much for an elected official that they elected. I think it was misleading when \$74,000 number came up. Here is my view on this perspective; it could not come at a worst time to raise the Mayor's salary. You know that it has to be done as the decision has been made, however I want you to know a little bit about the tax base, it wasn't part of your mission, it is in the process of eroding. We have Santa Fe Art & Design closing in a year; we have Sears and other retail stores closing. Nationwide the retail market is not doing well. We have LANL possibly to be managed by a non-profit, which seriously erodes the tax base in this city and state. Overall we have underfunded early childhood education, infrastructure projects that are on hold, we have public school cuts. People in this city are suffering and I want you to understand that when you look at the facts and the statistics. This is a very important message and I think it is important to send the right message at this time when the city is suffering. (Time) I want to say that in Rio Rancho their population is 93,800 and their Mayor is paid on the median household income is \$60,000. I support and think you should have a salary based on the median household income of Santa Fe.

#### Retired Chief Justice Patricio Serna

I was the Chairman of the Charter Review Commission, concluded our work in 2012 and in the ballot we included 9 amendments that all passed overwhelmingly, this is Amendment 9. We held over 16 public hearings in every city council district and 4 in city hall over a seven-month period and I am proud to say transparency was our model. The City Council approved all 9 recommendations that we had. I went to the voters and they approved all including Amendment 9. Chief Justice Serna said that Mr. Hultin, Chair and Ms. Boniface have gone over the data that they uses to get the range which has been in the press, I would dwell on that. I want to say that the people of Santa Fe have spoken and they want a full time Mayor. During those times we had something like 18 City Managers for three Mayor's, things have settled down. With a full time Mayor it will really settle down. I have studied the region city data and county data and notice that the County Manager and Superintendent, benefits are not included and they are still very high. My recommendation to you is that the salary range you based on that hard core data, true data – it is not false at all, it is reasonable and based on that data and he has confidence in the Independent Salary Commission and he feels that the Commission will not go for the high end of that range as you have heard the public speak. Congratulations for a job well done.

#### Kenneth Jacks, Santa Fe, NM

Contrary to what people have said, Santa Fe did vote for a salary of \$74,000. I think that had it said they were voting for a full time Mayor at the salary of \$145,000 to \$175,000 there would have been a different result on that amendment. Perhaps if we look at the high-end salaries we can see why we have budget deficits in our schools, in our counties and in our cities. I actually went further and checked the salary of the Mayor of NY, the largest city in the United States and the Mayor of Los Angeles, CA, the second largest city and they make an average of \$225,000 - \$238,000 for a city that is more complex and larger than Santa Fe. We are not hiring a CEO, we are electing a Mayor and we should pay the Mayor something more in line with what people in Santa Fe make, thank you.

#### Michael Harkavy, Resident of Santa Fe

I have a comment and a couple of questions, one the statistical analysis is very thorough – but it is exactly that a statistical analysis transitioning from a city manager form of government to a CEO form of government. The question concerns the infrastructure of those types of governance, as I do not see that as a criterion in your analysis here. What changes might transform from one type of government to another and does that impact salaries, does it impact the number of people that are employed, I don't see that here and would that change. I don't see that with the other cities, if we made that change from a City Manager form of Government to a full time CEO/Mayor form of management, not knowing what the other cities experienced when making that change. I would look at that if I were you.

#### Cindi Conn, Resident of Santa Fe

I would like to commend the commission for the extensive research and great data collected. I agree with Justice Serna that we now have in place a system that can have a strong Mayor with stability. We need to attract a leader who can truly lead the city. I think you get what you pay for, so I do believe in many ways we should look at the wage for the Mayor as a CEO and the leader of his team and he should be paid higher salary then the rest of his team members. I also would like to say that we should look at the salary levels what does that do to the salaries beneath the Mayor. We should look at that prior to establishing that range, what are the administrative layers that can be eliminated or reduced as we increase the wage of the Mayor. I do trust that you will make the rights decisions and I do commend your work, thank you.

#### Simon Brackley, President of Santa Fe Chamber of Commerce

Thank you for your service to our community, you have a difficult decision here. We appreciate your work on this task. Speaking with the business people around the community in the last 2 weeks, the primary feedback is the lack of detail of the chain of command, the responsibilities of the position and the accountability that will be attached between the Mayor and the other Managers in City Government. People are concerned about duplication, lack of transparency in this process. The decision you make this evening will carry forward for many years to come, it will not only affect our next election but beyond that as well. I think it is important to have transparency. With chain of command we have job responsibilities that in the chance that the voters would select someone who is not qualified for the position, what would happen then. People would want to know what steps they can take at that point. This is beyond the numbers; it goes to accountability, transparency and responsibility.

The Chair expressed his thanks to Mr. Brackley and reiterated that there would not be a decision tonight. They are receiving public comment and will make a decision at the next week meeting of the Independent Salary Commission. Thank you.

#### Rebecca Bustamante

I too think that many people in Santa Fe felt like they were voting for the \$74,000 salary for a full-time Mayor. I think that was the starting salary and I understood that once the Mayor would continue to work, the salary would be looked at. Right off the bat, taking the amount that is being suggested is very rough on the people in Santa Fe. We feel like, why are things being stated in a ballot that are kind of misleading. That is really frustrating to the people of Santa Fe. The other thing I would like to say about the data you are comparing, many of the 113 people you are looking at, except for a few have been appointed by the Mayor; City Manager and Assistant Manager, the others have put in 20 years and should be making a good salary after that many years. For another person to just come in and say, why should he or she not get more than the Mayor, these employees have worked their way in the system. I am concerned on how city can question why they are making the salary over \$74,000. We are going to look at the ballot in a serious way as citizens of Santa Fe as the wording was very mis-leading. It was a very difficult election here in Santa Fe. I hope you will understand that many people thought that he would only make \$74,000. We will need to look at the wording on the ballot as last time it made it a difficult process.

#### Debra van Hecht and has lived in Santa Fe for 31 years

With all due respect, I think you did your homework and you worked hard, and I know you are volunteers and appreciate that. I may speak for more then myself as I say, I find the City Manager and County Manager's salary ridiculously high and I know you have no control over that. When you think that the Mayor of Albuquerque which is much bigger, only makes \$109,000 a year, the Governor of NM only make \$110,000, the Lt. Governor makes \$85,000 a year and the Attorney General makes \$95,000 and in their responsibilities they take care of the entire state. I am concerned about this high salary that you are talking about, I have nothing more to say, thank you.

#### Karen Setters

I would like to point out something I researched before I came. Our United States Congress people who are in effect responsible for the safety of the US and international people in the community, they make \$174,000 a year and the proposal on the table for our Mayor goes up to \$175,000 plus with benefits can go up to \$220,000. Our city has been in a recession for a very long time. Out people are hurting, our businesses are closing, we are nearly in bankruptcy. We need to revise our transit system, our roads are a disgrace. We need to revise our transit system, our roads are a disgrace. We need to revise our transit system, our our city had no earthly idea of the high amount, I also voted to have our Mayor become our CEO but I had no earthly idea of the high amount, I was looking at a salary of \$63,000 for a small town or even \$74,000 with a good city manager, and I voted on this. Please consider the welfare of the citizens of Santa Fe, above the statistics of what other CEO's are making in other places.

#### Daphnee Banks - 10 years residency

I periodically admit, that periodically I think of going back to New York very often. However, one of the things I looked at today, the Mayor of NY makes, it is ridiculous what the Mayor makes and the size of the city. My major question, how do you expect to pay for this because as someone, and I don't need to repeat, spoke very well, we are almost practically in bankruptcy. Someone spoke very well that we are close to bankruptcy. Others have done a good job so I won't repeat. I do want to know, where are you going to get all of this money and why. Mayor has been Mayor for what, a year or two, and I don't think he has not done a good job of leading this city and I certainly don't want to give him a raise and pay for two other positions. We are talking about 3 full time high ranges of pay. I would like to know where you are going to get the money.

#### Toni D. Montoya, Santa Fe

I am happy to say that I have lived here for 60 years, I am one of the extinct breeds here. I still live on the Westside in my grandmother's house, our property taxes are up very high; we can barely afford to live. I am disabled, an ex-city employee and ex-school Santa Fe Public Schools employee, otherwise I would have been here for all of the meetings but I have been ill. I see your board and I see no one that I know, I know you are Donita's daughter, (referring to Shannon Lopez), I know everyone in Santa Fe. I can walk from Agua Fria Village all the way to the end of Agua Fria and tell you who is related in all the streets of the Westside, I have walked them. I have seen you guys in the Realtor papers on Sundays, but I don't see any connection with you at all, you don't represent me, at all. This salary, they pulled the rug from under me again. \$74,000, I thought that was perfect, not only perfect but good. First of all you don't promise your city employees that they are going to get a raise and then tell them they are not. If that had been my generation when I worked for the city, we would have been at the Mayor's office that morning. But our children are so intimidated, the ones that were born and raised here, we have kids that qualify for jobs in the city and they are hiring people from Albuquerque. They come in everyday and commute because they told all our families that they had affordable housing in Rio Rancho. I am sorry but you are not representative of me at all. There is Pre-K, who is it going to be for the rich. I don't think any Mayor deserves higher than that salary, which is what we voted for. I challenge you, I will put you in a place in any part of town, from the east side to the west side, any part of town, Southside, in facilities where you can go talk to people and they will tell you, believe me. I barely made it here tonight, I had to struggle because I don't do well at night but I came. It is so sad to see that the Mayor would disrespect our people. You know what you are Shannon, you are a token, that is what you are, sorry, and no disrespect to your Dad because I think he is a wonderful person, but that is what you are. I see all you people and you are not representative of the people on the west side. That is what has happened here in Santa Fe, we offer everyone and their mother here. The immigrants on the South side have Somos Un Pueblo Unido. The Native Americans, they have the casinos and who supports the casinos if not the residents of Santa Fe. (time) Who do we have, the City Council, I don't even know my City Councilor, at all. I have called her and never even once has she returned my call. Thank you and good night.

#### Greg Bemis - 35 years.

I want to commend you for the very professional job that you have done. I think you have only left one thing in the way you have approached this, and that one thing is proper statement of qualifications. The reason why that is so important is because the other thing you haven't done, recognizing the fact that you are not filling a job the Mayor is elected by the citizens. What you have done is perfect if you are hiring a Mayor, but you are not hiring a Mayor he is elected by the voters. There is no relationship between the qualifications that a Mayor should have to the qualifications of the Mayors we have had. You should not be paying for a silk purse if you are going to get a sow's ear.

<u>Kathrine Denko</u> – I am from Santa Fe and I am also an Educator for 13 years, let me tell you something. My point is, I was an educator for 16 years, \$33,000 is what they get at starting pay, and you want to sit up here and talk about this Mayor, I don't know what he has done. I sure haven't seen it, I am sorry, I am so angry right now if you can only think of paying someone this kind of money when you have educators who buy supplies for their students. They dig in to their pockets to buy supplies for their kids and that the fact that you can sit up there and do this. And I am sorry sir but you look so bored. It is sad, it is really sad. I am from the south side and I could go somewhere else, I speak 4 languages, I chose to stay here because I love Santa Fe. But what you guys are doing, wanting to put this man in, I am sorry, you don't represent us.

<u>Yvonne Chicoine</u>, Chairman of the Santa Fe County Republican Party, as a matter of full disclosure, I want to make it known that I am not a city resident but there are thousands of Santa Fe Republicans who are. The Santa Fe County Republican Party met last evening and expressed outrage at the proposed recommendation of the salary for a full time Mayor. There was universal agreement that the proposed salary ignored the voter's intent when they approved the Charter Amendment in 2014. This provides one more example of the dis-connect we have in this community between those who are elected and appointed to serve the interest of the public. One of the things that you have spoken about in detail is the Language of the ordinance, but when I read again the underlined portion of the Amendment says; until such said commission is created and sets the salary for Mayor, the Mayor's salary shall be \$74,000. Nothing in that or in the ordinance compels you to set a salary at all. There is no date required, you can say readily "we are not setting a salary" or you could say that you are going to set a salary of \$175,000 that takes affect in the year 3000. Mr. Chairman, you said that this was done by explicit direction of the voter, but the explicit direction of voter's when they voted, they saw a number of \$74,000 and that is what they voted on, the initial salary of their Mayor. There was no requirement that the Commission be created before the full time Mayor took effect. It was action from the City Council that it happens now. There was no direction from the community that it had to happen now. Again, this Commission does not have to render a decision now. Comparison to existing salaries that simply establishes that the salaries is far too high. Based on the economy of Santa Fe and the working people and what they are earning, gross receipts taxes they are paying and even higher taxes if the county has its way. If the city council approves the continuance of property tax which was supposed to be expiring to pay another increase in salaries, it is a total disconnect between who are elected officials are and who are suppose to represent the people and their failure to do so. Mr. Bernis made an election comparison regarding the CEO, we do not elect CEO's we elect Mayor's.

<u>Stephanie Benineto</u> and I have two native born New Mexican Daughters – lived in Santa Fe for 43 years.

I did not vote for the Mayor's increase, I did not vote for the charter provision. I want to point out that my understanding and my memory of the Charter Commission was that they held meetings but not too many people came. People on that Commission complained about lack of input from the public. Having this as a Charter Amendment 9 was very convenient because I think if you had put it as Charter Amendment 1 you might have had a totally different outcome. I am also in support of the people who say that this is not a CEO so comparing it to a CEO is bogus in my opinion. All the Mayor is going to do extra is administrative oversight of the two highly over paid people that are there now, the City Manager and the Asst. City Manager. The City Manager took the job at a certain salary, and after Javier Gonzales got elected he couldn't work at that low pay so we upped his salary and his benefits. He couldn't do his job so we hired an Assistant City Manager who is an IT experts but contracts all IT work. Who are we paying and what are we paying for? And to say that these people have earned this salary, and again it is my opinion it is bogus because we have people who have been appointed like Randy Randall, the head of the Tourism Department, he has just been on board for a couple of years and he is making \$160,000 with his benefits. And I think the salary range of these 120 people is outrageous for the city of Santa Fe given our tax base, given the median income and given the fact that most of these raises have been given since 2008 when we have been in a heavy recession. What about the city services that we don't have, like open public libraries in the evening, all recreation centers being open everyday of the week. I said, oh my gosh guess what, that would be when most people would be able to use them. In asking if the Mayor is qualified, what qualification does he/she have, because I have heard so many people say that the major qualification they consider, and these are mostly people who have been born here, because if you weren't born here you shouldn't be Mayor. So what would be the point if that is the qualification you don't deserve \$174,000 just for being born here. You have to have actual qualifications as an organizer, as a Manager and most of the people running for Mayor do not have that. I think there was a lack of transparency in the wording of the Charter Amendment, I think many of the people thought the Mayor was going to be paid \$74,000 and he is not doing anything more than what he was doing. I don't believe that the qualification part has been set out enough. (time) I would suggest that you make a recommendation of \$74,000 in total with benefits or as suggested by the previous speaker that you delay implementing that until the economy recovers.

#### Phil Kithil, 45 years in Santa Fe.

Regretfully this is probably the second time I have ever come to one of these events. The qualifications have been covered and obviously the Mayor is elected by the people, he has probably not terrifically relevant CEO qualifications, he has done other things, but he is not a CEO quality qualified person. That fails the test. The second thing about the high salary proposed, what will the pool of candidates be with a much better salary. Will you attract better people or worse people. I think you will attract worse people, they will be in it for the money. I think we had a Presidential candidate and she said she was it in for the money and she lost and look where we are now. You don't want people to be in it for the money you want them to be in it to make the City of Santa Fe a better place to live. Thank you.

#### Richard Barela, Grew up in Santa Fe

My grandfather donated land for the Guadalupe Church where the convent is and we have several streets named after our family. I have been fortunate to make a good living here, I am a CPA. semi-retired, and I know this community very well. My dad was a mechanic struggled, my mother a housewife and it was difficult. I see this city of Santa Fe and how difficult it is. I look at the city of Santa Fe, I have nephews I have to help. It seems every time government as a whole, is always trying to extract money from people. Look at the soda tax, I happen to like that lemonade, we pay \$4 that is another issues. It is the attitude of government, pick their pocket, now you have gross receipts tax the county is proposing. This salary of \$175,000, you have a city manager and assistant city manager. A Mayor has a lot of perks, he gets wined and dined, conventions here and there. I just don't see how in this community we had people struggle to get gas money, or pay their rent and now we are proposing this. Government has to stop picking peoples pocket. There is another proposal it is the speed van, they talk about a \$100 fine, the company is from Australia, the city will get \$1.00, 1%. The city keeps 30%, you create another department, a hearing officer, and we end up with zero, we extract people going back and forth. I am upset with the direction of this community and pretty much the rest of government. There has to be reasonableness in these decisions, \$174,000 that is incredible. (time) I hope you all have sense, it was disguised on the the ballot. I hope you oppose this.

#### Jim Williamson, 4th generation New Mexican

I am not directly criticizing the commission I am criticizing the process. Does anyone find it weird that the Mayor selects the people on this commission who decide his salary? Isn't that a conflict of interest? Isn't it AY personal knowledge someone proposing the strong Mayor initiative. Were any of those people on this council? Mr. Hultin and Mr. Wallerstein both donated to that proposal, and then they were named to this commission to set up the salary. In his campaign report right here, \$500 donation each and then they were put on this commission to decide the Mayor's salary. That is is a potential conflict of interest, I am not an attorney, but there is a definitely an appearance of impropriety. Your average person here in Santa Fe would say that something looks fishy if they didn't know any better and it certainly smells like that. Decisions should be when Mayor and City Council are here in March. I propose that the commission defers their decision until the new Mayor and City Councilors come on board in March. Thank you very much.

#### Mary Schruben, Santa Fe

Thank you for all of your work. My idea of the Mayor as a full time Mayor, especially from the meetings that we had, on the Amendment 2 Charter, is that a full time Mayor would be more of a Team Leader and at the same level of department heads, division directors and project managers. We would not have some pyramidal structure – but more a management structure that looks like the plaza where everyone sits around and works together. I think that many of the topics that have been brought up tonight are going to be subject for the election and for candidates to address on how they intend to disentangle the existing duties of the existing City Manager and the other leaders of the city management team and how the responsibilities and duties of the full time Mayor will be split up and I think that is going to depend a lot on citizen input during the election to make sure that we get answers from our candidates will propose for that. We don't have any solid information on how many hours the present Mayor spends travelling, meeting people, until midnight meetings where both she and Mr. Hochberg have been at. It is a time intensive job, and person intensive job and those attributes will need to be explored during that period. I hope that

everyone that runs for the Mayor understands that this is a shared responsibility with all the leaders of our city. We have a lot of work ahead of us in the city to help us face climate change, state government and our federal government

#### Joe Trujillo - Fiesta Street, Santa Fe, NM

I lived on Fiesta Street since I was knee high, I went to St. Francis Parochial School, Harvey Jr. High and went on to Santa Fe High and later on College of Santa Fe and fortunate enough to go to graduate school in Denver. I am very compelled to be here to speak because of my friend, my kids, my grandchildren. I voted in favor of the Mayor having a paid position with the understanding that the salary for the Mayor was at \$74,000. When I read in the paper it was up to \$175,000 plus the perks and could go up to \$240,000. There is no word to express my frustration about this. We should be ashamed of ourselves. It is deceptive, dishonest and the proponents of the \$175,000 salary should be ashamed of themselves. We have employees that can barely meet their obligations; we have seen recently them seeking a deputy city manager. I want to leave you with one thought, the community cannot afford a \$240,000 Mayor paid position and again I want to repeat myself, this is deceptive, dishonest and the proponents should be ashamed of themselves.

The Chair closed the Public Hearing.

7. Adjourn

Mr. Hochberg moved to adjourn the meeting of the Independent Salary Commission at 7:45 pm, second by Ms. Boniface, motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

Signature Page

Paul F. Hultin, Chair

XAM HULLO

Fran Lucero, Stenographer

Sign in sheet to speak Please Print Jaine KENNGTH JACKS GAYLE DAWN PRICE Senta FP, NM FELASE Jour tong Katherine Denko Educina M Thyllo Mary 2 Schruben. Tori D. Montoya Repecco Dustamante MICHAR HARKAW 12318 Cenni Hunlyan Epertin Jim Williamson Victor Romen Justice Patricio Serna CYNDI CONN Jonne Chicoine Exhibit A Kanon Notters Deborahvan Heck.

Phil Kithil SIMON BRID ON LIGY Daphner Banks Stephine Bennet

Exclusit A.

1	CITY OF SANTA FE, NEW MEXICO
2	ORDINANCE NO. 2016-43
3	
4	
5	AN ORDINANCE
6	AMENDING SUBSECTION 2-1.2 RELATING TO THE COMPENSATION OF THE
7	MAYOR; AND ESTABLISHING AN INDEPENDENT SALARY COMMISSION TO SET
8	THE MAYOR'S SALARY EFFECTIVE MARCH 19, 2018.
9	
10	BE IT ORDAINED BY THE GOVERNING BODY OF THE CITY OF SANTA FE:
11	Section 1. Subsection 2-1.2 SFCC 1987 (being Ord. #1985-66 as amended) is
12	amended to read:
13	2-1 MAYOR AND COUNCILORS
14	2-1.2 Compensation of Mayor and City Councilors
15	The mayor shall receive compensation for his or her service to the city as determined by
16	the independent salary commission pursuant to Subsection 6-19 SFCC 1987.
17	The councilors shall receive compensation for their service to the city, in an amount
18	equal to the maximum amount authorized by the legislature to be paid county commissions in
19	Class "A" counties, as provided in Section 4-44-4 NMSA 1978, and as may be amended
20	thereafter from time to time.
21	Section 2. A new Subsection 6-19 SFCC 1987 is ordained to read:
22	6-19 INDEPENDENT SALARY COMMISSION
23	6-18.1 Name; Creation; Purpose.
24	A. There is hereby created the independent salary commission ("commission") as
25	approved by the voters of the city of Santa Fe on March 4, 2014.
	1

Exhibit B.

,

1 Β. The sole purpose of the commission shall be to review and set the mayor's 2 salary, pursuant to Article 6.02(C) of the Santa Fe Municipal Charter. C. 3 The commission shall be independent from the office of the mayor and the 4 governing body so as to remove all conflicts of interest. 5 6-18.2 Powers and Duties. 6 Α. The commission shall have the sole power to review and set the mayor's salary 7 no less than once every four years. 8 Β. The commission shall set the salary of the mayor by comparing the salaries of 9 other public executives within the county of Santa Fe, including the Santa Fe county manager, 10 superintendent of Santa Fe public schools, and the city of Santa Fe city manager, as well as the 11 mayor's salary in cities of comparable size, cost of living, and diversity within the region. D. 12 The salary set by the commission shall go into effect the Monday immediately 13 following the regular election at which a mayor is elected or reelected. 14 6-18.3 Membership; Terms; Vacancies. 15 Α. Membership. The commission shall be comprised of seven (7) members, all of 16 whom must reside within the municipal boundaries of the city of Santa Fe. The mayor shall 17 appoint, with the advice and consent of the governing body, the members of the commission. The 18 commission shall consist of one member from each of the following categories: 19 1. One shall be a member of the Santa Fe chamber of commerce. 20 2. One shall be a representative of a neighborhood association. 21 3. One shall be a representative of a community organization. 22 4. One shall be a current or retired attorney or judge. 5. 23 One shall be a representative of the human resources industry, or an employment 24 consultant. 25 6. One shall be a current or retired chief executive officer.

2

د. مريدية 1

7.

One member shall be appointed at-large.

Nominees to the commission shall have the ability to exercise sound and practical judgement in
the implementation of their powers and duties as members of the commission. The mayor shall
appoint a chairperson prior to the first meeting of the commission. The chairperson shall then
appoint a vice chairperson at the first regular meeting.

B. Terms. Members of the commission shall serve four (4) year terms. A member
shall serve for no more than two (2) terms. After two (2) consecutive unexcused absences, a
commission member shall be automatically removed from the commission, and a new member
shall be appointed consistent with the provisions of subsection A.

C. Vacancies. Vacancies on the commission shall be filled consistent with the
 provisions of subsection A.

12

#### 6-18.4 Meetings; Staff.

A. Meetings. The commission shall meet no less than once every four years, no later than April 30 of the year prior to the election in which a mayor shall be elected or reelected so that the new salary may be included in the budget for the following fiscal year.

B. Staff. The Human Resources Director, or their designee, shall serve as staff
liaison for the commission at all meetings.

18 19

20

21

PASSED, APPROVED and ADOPTED, this 9<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2016.

JAVIER M. GONZALES, MAYOR

22 ATTEST:

23 24 oranda YOLANDA Y. VIGIL, CITY CLERK 25

3

APPROVED AS TO FORM: Mian KELLEY A. BRENNAN, CITY ATTORNEY M/Legislation/Ordinances 2016/Independent Salary Commission

SANTA FE COU		PUBLIC E	NTY PUBLIC EXECUTIVES
CITY OF SANTA FE (fiscal year 2018)	year 2018)		May 16, 2017
Position	Name	Salary	Benefits (in addition to salary)
City Manager	Brian Snyder	\$145,660.57	40%
2018 BUDGET	\$399,000,000.00		
NUMBER OF EMPLOYEES	1,401		
POPULATION	84,099		
SANTA FE COUNTY (fiscal year 2017)	l year 2017)		
Position	Name	Salary	Benefits (in addition to salary)
County Manager	Katherine Miller	\$179,707.22	35%
2017 BUDGET	\$338,648,350.00		
NUMBER OF EMPLOYEES	873		
POPULATION	64,552		
SANTA FE PUBLIC SCHOOLS (fiscal year	OLS (fiscal year 2017)		
Position	Name	Salary	Benefits (in addition to salary)
Superintendent	Dr. Veronica Garcia	\$180,000.00	35%
2016 BUDGET	\$219,086,903.00		
NUMBER OF EMPLOYEES	1735		
		•	

Thannon Boniface Resentation

Criticita

NEW MEXICO	lico						
City	Population	Governance	Mayor's Salary	+Benefits	Budget (FY 2018)	# of City Employees	COL Family of 4
SANTA FE	84,099	ceo / Full-Time		40.00%	\$399,000,000.00	1401	\$63,909.00
UTAH							
City	Population	Governance	Mayor's Salary	+Benefits	Budget (FY 2017)	# of City Employees	COL Family of 4
SALT LAKE CITY	192,672	CEO / FULL-TIME	\$138,133.00	41.76%	\$1,029,891,388.00	3,624	\$62,003.00
PROVO	112,488	CEO / FULL-TIME	\$120,000.00*	45.66%	\$234,735,030.00	1,881	\$59,215.00
ODGEN	85,444	CEO / FULL-TIME	\$117,739.00	48.38%	\$180,489,500.00	1,180	\$59,227.00
MURRAY	49,250	ceo / full-time	\$112,000.00		\$120,257,632.00	1,105	\$54,761.00
			*recommendation for 2	018 salary by Provo El	*recommendation for 2018 salary by Provo Elected Officials Compensation Commission	commission	
MONTANA	A						
City	Population	Governance	Mayor's Salary	+Benefits	Budget (FY 2017)	# of City Employees	COL Family of 4
MISSOULA	66,788	CEO / FULL-TIME	\$90,235.00	20.71%	\$124,549,353.00	638	\$70,683.00
WYOMING	ַם						
City	Population	Governance	Mayor's Salary	+Benefits	Budget (FY 2017)	# of City Employees	COL Family of 4
CHEYENNE	63,335	CEO / FULL-TIME	\$95,000.00		\$88,730,449.00	750	\$72,869.00
IDAHO							
City	Population	Governance	Mayor's Salary	+Benefits	Budget (FY 2017)	# of City Employees	COL Family of 4
MERIDIAN	75,092	CEO / FULL-TIME	\$90,956.00		\$119,946,412.00	414	\$58,970.00
POCATELLO	54,255	CEO / FULL-TIME	\$76,497.00	21.54%	\$112,005,974.00	200	\$56,991.00
						Lyl	typhint &

May 16, 2017

**REGIONAL CITY DATA** 

							ify of four the national
	Ķ	%Ş, 6	ę ș	10%	%ZT	%01- %01-	ge of \$65,597 for a far 100 which is noted as
FCOL percent change							ared to the national avera and on an index starting at
Cost of Living for Family of 4 FCOL percent change	\$63,909	\$62,003 \$59,215	528,227 54,761	\$70,683	\$72,869	\$58,970 \$56,991	FCOL) percent change is comp These percent changes are be the year 2015.
	\$65,597						Footnote: Federal Cost Of Living (FCOL) percent change is compared to the national average of 565,597 for a family of four finantied couple with 2 children). These percent Changes are based on an index starting at 100 which is noted as the national overall average. This data is from the year 2015.
# of City Employees Avenage U.S Income	1401	3,624 1,861	2011	638	750	414 500	Υ <u>τ</u> 6
Budget	\$ 399,000,000.00 * See Footnote	00.0E0,257,AE2 \$	\$ 130,489,500.00 \$ 120,257,632.00	83,174,00 \$ 124,549,353.00	95,000.00 \$ 88,730,449.00	\$ 119,946,412.00 \$ 112,005,974.00	
Mayor Salary		181, 934.00 \$ 155,307.00	\$ 176,059.00 5 129,186.00	00'4/1'EB \$		\$ 90,956.00 \$ 76,497.00	
per household	50,737.00	53,889.00 41,291.00	41,036.00 54,685.00	41,421.00	\$ 00'612'85	63,023.00 40,269.00	
ita Income I	31,973.00 \$	28,930.00 \$ 17,552.00 \$	\$ 00'550'61 \$ 00'550'62	25,741.00 \$	\$ 00'696'62	27,427,00 \$ 20,697.00 \$	
Income per cap	5 31,9	\$ 28,9 \$ 17,5	\$ 19,5 \$ 29,0	\$ 25,7	5,65 \$	5 27,4 5 20,6	
Population Governance Form Income per capita Income	84,099 CEO/Fult-time mayor	192,672 CEO/Full-time mayor 112,488 CEO/Full-time mayor	85,444 CEO/Full-time mayor 49,250 CEO/Full-time mayor	66,788 CEO/Full-time mayor	63,335 CEO/Full-time mayor	75,092 CEO/Full-time mayor 54,255 CEO/Full-time mayor	
City Popul	New Mexico Santa Fe°	Utah Sait Lake Chy <sup>a</sup> Provo	Ogden Murray	Montana Missoula	Wyoming Cheyenne	idaho Meridian Pocatello	

"Budget Approved by the Governing Book for Fiscal Year 2017. http://www.sanlafenewnssiscan.com/news/boain news/councet-approver-m-operating-budget/anticle\_4206/200-5cce-5386-se11-6720500e125.html

Source for Cost of Living: http://cost-of-living.careertrends.com

City New Mexico	Population Governance Form	Income	er capita	income per capita Income per household Mayor Salary	household	Mayor Sal		Budget	# of City Employees	
Santa Fe*	84,099 CEO/Full-time mayor	Ş	31,973.00	Ŷ	50,737.00			\$ 306,213,395.00	1401	
Utah										
Salt Lake City*	•••	ŝ	28,930.00	Ŷ	53,889.00	\$ 1£	181,934.00	\$ 1,029,891,388.00	3,624	
Provo	112,488 CEO/Full-time mayor	Ŷ	17,552.00	Ş	41,291.00	\$ 15	155,307.00	\$ 234,735,030.00	1,881	
Ogden	85,444 CEO/Full-time mayor	Ŷ	19,513.00	Ş	41,036.00	\$ 17	176,059.00	\$ 180,489,500.00	1,180	
Murray	49,250 CEO/Full-time mayor	Ŷ	29,055.00	Ŷ	54,685.00	\$ 12	129,186.00	\$ 120,257,632.00	1,105	
<b>Montana</b> Missoula	66,788 CEO/Full-time mayor	ŝ	25,741.00 \$	Ś	41,421.00 \$		33.174.00	83.174.00 \$ 124.549.353.00	853	
Wyoming			·							
Cheyenne *	63,335 CEO/Full-time mayor	Ŷ	29,969.00	Ş	58,219.00	\$	95,000.00 \$	\$ 88,730,449.00	750	
<b>Idaho</b> Meridian	75 003 CEO/Eu/H time marine	ئ		ł						
Pocatello	54,255 CEO/Full-time mayor	ሱ ላን	20,697.00 20,697.00	ሱ ‹››	63,U23.UU 40,269.00	~ ~	90,956.00 76,497.00	\$ 119,946,412.00 \$ 112,005,974.00	414 500	

•

New Mexico	White	HIspanic B	Black Asian	
Santa Fe*	46.20%	48.70%	1.00%	1.90%
Utah				
Salt Lake City*	77.10%	17.60%	13.30%	4.80%
Provo	84.80%	15.20%	0.70%	2.50%
Ogden	75.20%	30.10%	2.20%	1.20%
Murray	88.60%	9.10%	1.70%	2.40%
<b>Montana</b> Missoula	92.10%	2.90%	0.50%	1.20%
<b>Wyoming</b> Cheyenne*	78.70%	14.50%	2.90%	1.20%
Idaho				
Meridian	88.10%	6.80%	0.80%	1.80%
Pocatello	86.80%	7.20%	1.00%	1.60%

www.census.gov

https://www.santafecountynm.gov/human\_resources/employment\_benefits

http://www.utahsright.com/salaries.php?city=all&query=mayor

http://newstalkkgvo.com/update-on-missoula-mayor-john-engens-pay-increases-new-numbers-and-responses-from-city/

http://www.murray.utah.gov/148/Annual-Budget-CAFR http://provo.org/Home/ShowDocument?id=9322

http://mt-missoula2.civicplus.com/DocumentCenter/View/32964

https://www.cheyennecity.org/DocumentCenter/View/22226

http://www.meridiancity.org/uploadedFiles/Departments/Finance/FY2017%200f%200f%20Meridian%20Budget%20Notice%20for%20Clerks% http://www.pocatello.us/ArchiveCenter/ViewFile/Item/393

http://1063cowboycountry.com/what-is-marian-orrs-new-salary-as-cheyenne-mayor/

City of Santa Fe Independent Salary Commission Data

18

## 03/31/17

## City of Santa Fe

<b>City Administration Salaries</b>			
Position	Name	Salary	<b>Benefits / Retirement TBD</b>
City Manager	Snyder, Brian	\$142,812.80	
City Attorney	Kelley, Brennan	\$120,681.60	
Deputy City Manager	Martinez, Jennifer	\$130,000.00	
Finance & Budget Director	Johnson, Adam	\$123,177.60	
2016 Fiscal Budget	\$306,213,395.00		
Number of Employees	1401		

		-			
City	Mayor's Salary	Population	Budget	Form of governance B	Benefit packages
Santa Fe, NM	TBD	84,099	\$306,213,395.00	Strong Mayor (CEO)	

Asian	1.90%
Black	1.00%
Latino/Hispanic	48.70%
White	46.20%
Income per capita	\$27,756.00
City	Santa Fe, NM

City of Santa Fe Independent Salary Commission Data

# Santa Fe County

Santa Fe County Administrative Officials		
Position	Name	Salary
County Attorney	Gregory Shaffer	\$126,084.40
County Manager	Katherine Miller	\$179,707.22
Deputy County Manager	Tony Flores	\$112,509.07
Finance Division Director	Don Moya	\$106,999.98
County Budget	\$297,946,652.00	
Number of Employees	873	

	*estimate from US Canone 07/01/2015	
Population of Santa Fe County (minus SF city limits population)	64,552*	

2

ĺ

## 03/31/17

# Santa Fe Public Schools

Administrative salaries		
Position	Name	Salary
Superintendent	Dr. Veronica Garcia	\$166,363.00
Deputy Superintendent of Teaching, Learning, and School Support	Dr. Almi Abeyta	TBD
Chief Financial and Governmental Relations Officer	Carl Gruenler	TBD
2016-17 Budget	\$102,000,000*	
Number of Employees	TBD	
*From Santa Fe New Mexican		

· •

## 03/31/17

# Data Sources (preliminary data)

L

Cities	Source
Santa Fe County	https://www.santafecountynm.gov/sunshine reports/employees.php?sort=position&page=9
	https://www.santafecountynm.gov/media/files/FY16PUBLICBUDGETDOCUMENTFINAL1-25-2016.pdf
Santa Fe	https://www.santafenm.gov
	http://Salary.com
Santa Fe Public	https://ballotpedia.org/Santa Fe Public Schools, New Mexico#cite note-14
Schools	

-

4

TO: Shannon Moore Boniface	
----------------------------	--

FROM: Jenna Davis, Casey Mulligan, Koen Alberts

DATE: May 16, 2017

CC: Paul Hultin

RE: Santa Fe Independent Salary Commission Research Methodology and Sources

This is where we are today. This will be updated as we receive responses to outstanding inquiries and additional information is received.

#### Salt Lake City, Utah

The Mayor's salary was obtained by calling the Human Resources Department in Salt Lake City and speaking with David Salazar, Compensation Coordinator, who informed us that the salary without benefits was \$138,133. David directed us to a website that confirmed this salary and provided the Mayor's benefit package. According to Mr. Salazar, the Mayor of Salt Lake City receives the benefits listed under "Public Employees Non-Contributory System". This document and Mr. Salazar's contact information are listed in Appendix A.

#### Provo, Utah

The Mayor's salary used in our initial report to the ISC was found on the website <u>utahsright.com</u>. This website did not distinguish between benefits and base salary. This is the source of the \$155,307 salary number that we used for our initial report to the ISC. However, the 2017 Provo Mayor's Salary Commission Report we have since obtained stated that the base salary was \$109,500, not including benefits. The 2018 Salary listed in this report is \$120,000. For the benefits, in 2017, the Mayor can accept up to \$50,000; however, this number is dependent on his insurance coverage. Becky Graham confirmed the benefit number in Human Resources for the year 2017. Her contact information can be found below. We have contacted the head of Human Resources to find out if the 2017 benefit package is different for 2018. We have not gotten a response back for the 2018 benefits package. Exhibit A displays the memo that was used for the Mayor's salary in 2017 and 2018.

#### Ogden, Utah

The salary and benefits data were obtained from utahsright.com. An email was sent to the Hedi Olmedo who works in Human Resources in Ogden. She confirmed the salary and benefits listed for the year 2017. We have contacted Hedi Olmedo again for information on the Mayor's salary in 2018 but, have not heard back yet.

#### Murray, Utah

The Mayor's initial salary in the ISC report was found on the website utahsright.com. The website did not distinguish between benefits and salary. This is the source of the \$129,186 salary number that was used in the initial report. However, the 2017 Provo Mayor's Salary Commission Report we have since obtained stated base salary at \$112,000, not including benefits for 2017. The Human Resources Department has been contacted to confirm the salary and to clarify how much the benefits would add; an official report was required to obtain this information and we have not heard back yet.

#### Missoula, Montana

The salary was found in a news article where the reporter had gathered information from The Finance Department. The Finance Department budgets a salary every year for the Mayor at \$90,235 and benefits of \$23,569; however, because the Mayor works hourly, he may not receive the full budgeted amount. Assuming the Mayor receives the full amount, the total comes out to be \$113,804 This news article is cited in Appendix A.

#### Cheyenne, Wyoming

The Mayor's salary information was obtained through Scott Smith, a City of Cheyenne Spokesman, who told reporter Scott LeTourneau in January, 2017 that the Mayor's salary starts at \$95,000 a year; this was confirmed by Human Resources. To verify this information and obtain benefits information, an email was sent to the Cheyenne Human Resource Director. We have not heard back.

#### Pocatello, Idaho

The Pocatello Human Resources Department Director clarified that the base salary is \$76,496. She also stated that for the Mayor and his family, the city pays out \$69 per month for dental coverage, \$1302 for medical, and \$2.56 for life insurance. Finally, she noted that benefits for future Mayors may be different based on the Mayors own insurance coverage.

#### Meridian, Idaho

The Mayor salary information was obtained through my meridian press website, which can be found in Appendix A. An article, from July 2015 titled 'Committee recommends salary boost for Meridian's elected officials' confirms salary increases for the Meridian Mayor. For 2017, the Mayor's salary "would increase to \$90,956 in 2017." This article can be found in Appendix A. To determine whether benefits are included or are in addition to this number, the Human Resources Department was called and emailed. We were directed to submit a public record request. Crystal Ritchie was the contact confirming this information.

#### Appendix A

Salt Lake City, Utah

- David Salazar confirmed the salary. He is the compensation manager for Salt Lake City. (801) 535-7906

-Salt Lake City's Annual Compensation Plan: http://www.slcdocs.com/HR/FY17\_Compensation.pdf

Provo, Utah

-https://www.utah.gov/pmn/files/292023.pdf

Ogden, Utah

- Heidi Olmedo confirmed the Mayor's salary. She works in the Human Resource Department. (801) 629-8737

Murray, Utah

-http://www.utahsright.com/salaries.php?city=murray

- This site states it was published to create transparency of government for the citizens of Utah.

Missoula, Montana

- News article: <u>http://newstalkkgvo.com/missoula-mayor-john-</u> <u>engen-took-a-pay-raise-after-saying-he-wouldnt-paycheck-up-</u> <u>over-50-percent-during-tenure/</u>

Cheyenne, Wyoming

-The source of the article was: http://1063cowboycountry.com/what-is-marian-orrs-new-salary-

- as-cheyenne-mayor/
- Denise Freeman, HR Director can be contacted at dfreeman@cheyennecity.org

Pocatello, Idaho

- Healther Buchanan in Human Resources can be contacted at (208) 234-6170

Meridian, Idaho

-The link is <u>http://www.mymeridianpress.com/news/committee-</u> recommends-salary-boost-for-meridian-s-electedofficials/article\_e1f762fc-2c3b-11e5-abab-9fb04b78c9c0.html - Article cited: <u>http://www.mymeridianpress.com/news/committee-</u> recommends-salary-boost-for-meridian-s-elected-

officials/article\_e1f762fc-2c3b-11e5-abab-9fb04b78c9c0.html

#### Exhibit A

#### Provo Mayor Annual Salary Recommendation by the Elected Officials Compensation Commission March 2017

March 27, 2017

Under Provo Utah City Ordinance 4.04.125, the Elected Officials Compensation Commission is created once every four years, in the same year that the mayoral election is held. It is tasked with recommending the annual salary for the mayor to the Provo City Municipal Council.

After deliberation, the Elected Officials Compensation Commission unanimously recommends an annual salary of \$120,000.00. Our recommendation is based on two points:

- 1. Evaluation of the annual salaries of mayors in comparable Utah cities, as directed by the ordinance; and,
- 2. Consideration of the scope of duties of the Provo mayor

It is based on comparison of the annual salaries of other mayors in the State of Utah:

Provo's population is 113,000. The average annual salary of full-time Utah mayors serving cities of populations of 85,000+ is \$121,703. This average is for the mayoral salaries from Ogden, Salt Lake City, Sandy, and West Jordan (see chart on page 2, as provided by the Division Director of Provo City Human Resources). The Compensation Commission posits that these cities are most comparable to Provo in terms of population (85,000+) and that the Provo mayor's salary should be in keeping with other full-time mayors in the region.

Further, we consider the scope of duties of the mayor:

The Provo mayor faces challenges unique to the City of Provo. In addition to its high rate of growth, Provo has both its own power department and its own commercial airport. These place additional duties and responsibilities on the Provo mayor which are not faced by the mayors of other Utah cities of comparable size. The Compensation Commission states that these extra duties, combined with the other issues inherent to a city the size of Provo, warrant a higher level of compensation than the mayor has been receiving.

For these reasons, the City of Provo Elected Officials Compensation Commission recommends that the annual salary for the mayor be set at \$120,000.00 per year beginning January 1, 2018. We recommend that the existing benefits remain in effect.

Submitted unanimously by the members of the Elected Officials Compensation Commission, each of whom is a Provo resident:

#### Provo Mayor Annual Salary Recommendation by the Elected Officials Compensation Commission March 2017

which we wanted with

1000 C

Local Sector Contraction of the Contraction of the

David Acheson, Chair Ray Christensen Kevin Garver Ben Markham Cameron Martin Kimberly Scoville Deon Turley

4

. •

#### 2017 Utah cities mayor salaries

Agency I	Marcholeskar I	- Fondellore III
Eagle Mountain	\$70,000	23,000
South Salt Lake	\$81,492	23,000
Logan	\$86,278	49,000
West Jordan	\$89,500	102,000
Tooele	\$95,502*	32,000
Provo	\$109,500	113,000
Murray	\$112,000	49,000
Ogden	\$117,740	85,000
Salt Lake City	\$138,133	190,000
Salt Lake County	\$149,257	985,000
Sandy	\$141,440	93,000

#### Santa Fe Public Schools Top 100 Salaries - SFPS

•

.

Description	Salary		Hourly Rate	Contract Days		
SUPERINTENDENT	\$	180,000	\$ 86.54	260		
CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER	\$	130,000	\$ 62.50	260		
CHIEF ACADEMIC OFFICER	\$	125,000	\$ 60.10	260		
CHIEF OPERATIONS OFFICER	\$	117,000	\$ 56.25	260		
ASSISTANT SUPERINTENDENT	\$	115,000	\$ 55.29	260		
ASSOC SUPT SCHOOL IMPROV/SOC JUST	\$	115,000	\$ 55.29	260		
CHIEF LEGAL COUNSEL	\$	104,000	\$ 50.00	260		
DEPUTY CHIEF INFORMATION OFFICER	\$	101,740	\$ 48.91	260		
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR-HUMAN RESOURCES	\$	97,500	\$ 46.88	260		
PRINCIPAL	\$	97,500	\$ 46.88	260		
PRINCIPAL	\$	95,000	\$ 45.67	260		
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR-FINANCE & ADMINISTRATION	\$	94,600	\$ 45.48	260		
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR-SPED	\$	93,000	\$ 44.71	260		
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR CURRICULUM AND PROFESSIONAL	\$	93,000	\$ 44.71	260		
PRINCIPAL	\$	92,500	\$ 44.47	260		
PRINCIPAL	\$	92,173	\$ 44.31	260		
DIRECTOR-TECHNOLOGY	\$	85,000	\$ 40.87	260		
PRINCIPAL	\$	85,000	\$ 40.87	260		
DIRECTOR-SPED	\$	85,000	\$ 40.87	260		
DIRECTOR-STUDENT NUTRITION	\$	84,150	\$ 40.46	260		
PRINCIPAL	\$	83,500	\$ 52.19	200		
DIRECTOR-FUND MANAGEMENT	\$	82,500	\$ 39.66	260		
DIRECTOR - DIGITAL LEARNING	\$	82,500	\$ 39.66	260		
DIRECTOR-STUDENT DATA	\$	82,500	\$ 39.66	260		
PRINCIPAL	\$	81,906	\$ 51.19	200		
DIRECTOR-STUDNT SUPP PROGRAMS	\$	81,204	\$ 39.04	260		
PRINCIPAL	\$	81,158	\$ 50.72	200		
PUBLIC INFORMATION OFFICER	\$	80,000	\$ 38.46	260		
DIRECTOR-GENERAL SERVICES	\$	80,000	\$ 38.46	260		
ASSISTANT DIRECTOR-HR	\$	80,000	\$ 38.46	260		
DIRECTOR-MULTICULTURAL EDUCATION	\$	80,000	\$ 38.46	260		
PRINCIPAL	\$	80,000	\$ 50.00	200		
PRINCIPAL	\$	78,850	\$ 37.91	260		
COORDINATOR-INSTRUCTIONAL PROGRAMS	\$	78,700	\$ 37.84	260		
DIAGNOSTICIAN	\$	78,553	\$ 43.07	200		
DIAGNOSTICIAN	\$	78,421	\$ 42.99	200		
SPECIALIST-INSTRUCTIONAL DATA/ACCOUNT SUPPORT	\$	78,244	\$ 37.62	260		

#### Santa Fe Public Schools Top 100 Salaries - SFPS

. .

Top Top Salaries - SFPS			
SPECIALIST-TIENET IEP SUPPORT	\$ 78,127	\$ 37.56	260
DIAGNOSTICIAN	\$ 78,093	\$ 42.81	200
PRINCIPAL	\$ 78,037	\$ 48.77	200
PRINCIPAL	\$ 78,037	\$ 48.77	200
DIAGNOSTICIAN	\$ 78,000	\$ 42.78	200
DIRECTOR-FAMILY & COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT	\$ 77,650	\$ 37.33	260
DIRECTOR-TRANSPORTATION	\$ 77,650	\$ 37.33	260
PRINCIPAL	\$ 77,650	\$ 48.75	200
COORDINATOR-INSTRUCTIONAL PROGRAMS	\$ 77,500	\$ 37.26	260
PRINCIPAL	\$ 77,500	\$ 48.44	200
PRINCIPAL	\$ 77,500	\$ 48.44	200
DIRECTOR-SAFETY AND SECURITY	\$ 77,500	\$ 37.33	260
SPECIALIST-GIFTED SUPPORT	\$ 75,324	\$ 42.80	220
SPECIALIST-BEHAVIOR SPECIALIST	\$ 75,248	\$ 42.75	220
PRINCIPAL-ASSISTANT	\$ 75,000	\$ 36.06	260
ASSISTANT PRINCIPAL	\$ 75,000	\$ 36.06	260
PRINCIPAL-ASSISTANT	\$ 75,000	\$ 36.06	260
ASSISTANT PRINCIPAL	\$ 75,000	\$ 36.06	260
ASSISTANT PRINCIPAL	\$ 75,000	\$ 36.06	260
ASSISTANT DIRECTOR-CAPITAL PROJECTS	\$ 75,000	\$ 36.06	260
PRINCIPAL-ASSISTANT	\$ 75,000	\$ 37.02	260
PRINCIPAL	\$ 72,500	\$ 45.31	200
PRINCIPAL	\$ 72,500	\$ 45.31	200
PRINCIPAL	\$ 72,500	\$ 45.31	200
PRINCIPAL	\$ 72,500	\$ 45.31	200
PRINCIPAL	\$ 72,500	\$ 45.31	200
PRINCIPAL	\$ 72,500	\$ 45.55	200
COMPTROLLER	\$ 72,000	\$ 34.62	260
ATHLETIC COORDINATOR HS/MS	\$ 72,000	\$ 34.62	260
COORDINATOR-FEDERAL PROGRAMS	\$ 71,460	\$ 34.36	260
SPECIALIST-VIS IMPAIRED	\$ 70,629	\$ 40.13	220
CHIEF INFORMATION & STRATEGY OFFICER	\$ 70,500	\$ 56.49	156
TECHNOLOGY SUPPORT	\$ 70,025	\$ 33.67	260
PRINCIPAL	\$ 70,000	\$ 43.75	200
PRINCIPAL	\$ 70,000	\$ 43.75	200
PRINCIPAL	\$ 70,000	\$ 43.75	200
PRINCIPAL	\$ 70,000	\$ 43.75	200
PRINCIPAL	\$ 70,000	\$ 43.75	<b>20</b> 0
SPEECH LANGUAGE THERAPIST	\$ 69,828	\$ 42.82	182
DEAN OF STUDENTS NON-CERTIFIED	\$ 68,620	\$ 38.12	200

#### Santa Fe Public Schools Top 100 Salaries - SFPS

•

Top 100 Salaries - SFF5			
DISTRICT ENGLISH LANGUAGE COACH	\$ 68,598	\$ 42.87	200
PROGRAM SUPPORT SPECIALIST-LICENSED	\$ 68,562	\$ 42.10	200
MUSIC COORDINATOR	\$ 68,505	\$ 32.94	260
SPECIALIST-AUTISM SUPPORT	\$ 68,503	\$ 42.81	200
PROGRAM SUPPORT SPECIALIST-LICENSED	\$ 68,489	\$ 42.81	200
DIAGNOSTICIAN	\$ 68,489	\$ 42.81	200
SPECIALIST-PRESCHOOL, HEADSTART, RELATED SUPPORT	\$ 68,476	\$ 42.80	200
DIRECTOR-PROPERTY	\$ 68,350	\$ 32.86	260
DEAN OF STUDENTS NON-CERTIFIED	\$ 68,301	\$ 42.80	200
LEAD NURSE	\$ 68,232	\$ 42.65	200
COORDINATOR-PREVENTION	\$ 67,595	\$ 38.41	220
PRINCIPAL	\$ 67,500	\$ 42.19	200
PRINCIPAL	\$ 67,500	\$ 42.02	200
COORDINATOR-RTI/SAT & DIR SUMM PGRMS	\$ 67,150	\$ 41.97	200
CONSTRUCTION PROJECT MANAGER	\$ 66,900	\$ 32.18	260
CONSTRUCTION PROJECT MANAGER	\$ 66,900	\$ 32.18	260
CONSTRUCTION PROJECT MANAGER	\$ 66,900	\$ 32.18	260
PARENT EDUCATOR COORDINATOR	\$ 66,900	\$ 32.18	260
COORDINATOR-ASSESSMENT AND DATA	\$ 66,900	\$ 32.18	260
COORDINATOR-ENERGY CONSERVATION	\$ 66,900	\$ 32.18	260
COORDINATOR-ASSESSMENT AND DATA	\$ 66,900	\$ 32.18	260
DIAGNOSTICIAN	\$ 65,148	\$ 40.82	200
ASSISTANT PRINCIPAL	\$ 65,000	\$ 40.63	200
ASSISTANT PRINCIPAL	\$ 65,000	\$ 40.63	200
ASSISTANT PRINCIPAL	\$ 65,000	\$ 40.63	200
ASSISTANT PRINCIPAL	\$ 65,000	\$ 40.63	200
ASSISTANT PRINCIPAL	\$ 65,000	\$ 40.63	200